

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE  
AT KNOXVILLE

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,	)	
Plaintiff	)	
v.	)	NO.: 3:21-CR-38-KAC-DCP
	)	
BENJAMIN ALAN CARPENTER	)	
Aka Abu Hamzah,	)	
Defendant.	)	

**DEFENDANT'S NOTICE OF EXPERT TESTIMONY**

Defendant Benjamin Carpenter, though undersigned counsel, hereby respectfully provides notice that he intends to introduce certain evidence pursuant to Rule 702 of the Federal Rules of Evidence.

**Drew Paul, Ph.D.**

Professor Drew Paul is an Associate Professor of Arabic in the Department of World Languages and Cultures at the University of Tennessee, Knoxville. He serves as the Chair of the Arabic and Hebrew Programs in the Department. Professor Paul is also the Director of Undergraduate Studies in the Department of World Languages and Cultures.

The witness's qualifications are disclosed on the incorporated *curriculum vitae*.

In formulating his opinions Professor Paul has reviewed the following case specific documents:

1. The chat communications provided in discovery
2. The Arabic translation of *Bleeding Campaigns* provided by the Government
3. The original and updated Word translations of *Bleeding Campaigns* provided by the OCE

4. The English version of the edited translation of *Bleeding Campaigns* allegedly returned to the OCE
5. The *Bleeding Campaigns* video provided in discovery with English subtitles
6. Dr. Winter's summary: Video Analysis: "Bleeding Campaigns"
7. District Court filings 119 and 119-1: Expert Disclosure of Kamel
8. District Court filing 120 and 120-1: Second Supplemental Expert Disclosure of Dr. Winter

Professor Paul also relies on his academic training and experience as well as practical experience, including living in areas in which Arabic is spoken as the primary language.

In order to provide the broadest possible disclosure of Professor Paul's opinions, Mr. Carpenter is disclosing Professor Paul's outline upon reviewing the case related materials. Professor Paul's opinions are as follows:

1. There are some changes that could be construed as improving the translation.
  - a. There are numerous edits, such as those in sections 2:16-2:32, 8:30-9:07, 9:22-10:15, and 13:23-13:55 that fix grammatical errors in English, most commonly mistakes in verb conjugation.
  - b. There are a handful of examples of the substitution of terms like "Kenanah" for "Egypt," which is consistent with what are stated to be ISIS propaganda strategies to redefine terms in order to deploy them for their own purposes. Another possible example is in the section 3:11-4:03, where "the trust" is changed to the transliteration of the Arabic equivalent "Amanah." As expert Kamel notes, this could be seen as contributing to improving the propaganda appeal, but on the other hand, there are very few examples of this in the translation. Both of these examples are part of the chants that I discuss below.
2. There are other changes that could detract from the objective of "clearest possible English."
  - a. In certain cases, the English translation is edited to more closely resemble the source Arabic, at the expense of fluency in English. For example:
    - i. 2:33-2:46 – "This battle followed the fate of the others" becomes "So this battle followed the fate of its sisters" – literal translation, but makes less sense in English.
    - ii. In the section 11:38-12:59- "Are you not rational?" is edited to, "Is there not among you a rational?" which is closer to the Arabic, which word-for-

- word says, “Is there not among you a rational man?” but is not particularly good colloquial English.
- iii. Note: The tendency to produce overly literal translations can occur for multiple reasons. Lack of proficiency at translating, limits of English language proficiency, and/or limits of Arabic language proficiency. However, the latter seems unlikely, since this translator appears to be a highly proficient Arabic speaker. (see point 4 below).
  - b. Occasionally there are edits that make the English less clear that do not also more closely resemble the Arabic (these are not common). For example, in 23:38-24:32: “Roll up your sleeves (misspelled)” becomes “be diligent to it”, even though “roll up your sleeves” is also used in Arabic.
3. Many of the other changes likely had little or no substantive impact on the effectiveness of the video.
- a. Many of the changes were minor and stylistic in nature.
  - b. Many of the more substantive changes were to the sections that were part of the acapella chants (nasheeds) that repeat throughout the video. While the meanings of these chants are relevant, their impact within the video is about much more than literal meaning. They constitute the “soundtrack” to the video and exist to set the mood, create a particular tone, and provoke certain emotional reactions in the audience, such as awe and inspiration. These effects are accomplished through sound, and is not dependent on the particularities of the English translation. In fact, even if these were not translated at all into English, their impact on the tone and mood of the video would likely remain the same. In fact, there are some repeated phrases in the video, such as “Allahu Akbar” that are not translated at all, but their presence is still impactful.
4. Many of the sections added from the video (green in the analyst’s text), are either from the chants (10:16-10:35, 15-15:30, 16:11-16:57), or from the interviews with the people deemed traitors (9:22-10:15, 13:23-13:55). Language wise, these are some of the most difficult passages to translate, because they are chanted and highly stylized, or they are in a local Egyptian dialect. These sections would require high MSA proficiency and some familiarity with Egyptian Arabic.

**Comments on the translations and Expert Karam Kamel’s commentary on them:**

- 1. “He will note that rote word-for-word Arabic-English translations (such as those that may be produced by an Arabic/English-language dictionary or translation software) often garble the underlying meaning of the message being conveyed.”
  - a. This is true, in general.
  - b. However, it is not clear that the revisions to the translation improve it in this respect. It does in some places, as the expert notes, but there are also quite a few examples of the revised translation being edited to be more literal to the original Arabic, in ways that make it less eloquent and less clear to an English-language audience.
    - i. For example, the final paragraph, which is one of the more heavily edited sections, is more accurate to the original Arabic, and more literal. However, the FBI translation would be more colloquially legible in

English. So, its impact would be dependent on who the audience is. If the audience is a general English-speaking audience, it would likely be less legible after the defendant's alleged edits. However, if the primary audience is individuals who are already deeply immersed in the rhetoric of Islamic militants, it could be more convincing.

- ii. In the section 11:38-12:59- "Are you not rational?" is edited to, "Is there not among you a rational?" which is closer to the Arabic, which word-for-word says, "Is there not among you a rational man?" but is not particularly good colloquial English.
  - iii. In the section 21:48-22:18- several instances of editing the translation to make it closer to the Arabic. "Stop the operations of the mujahideen" becomes "Stop the wheels of jihad", and "the others carried out their plans" becomes "as all the surrounding parties became involved in executing its chapters."
  - iv. 2:33-2:46 – "This battle followed the fate of the others" becomes "So this battle followed the fate of its sisters" – literal translation, but makes less sense in English.
  - v. 2:56-3:10 – new version is closer to the Arabic, which makes it more awkward in English sometimes ("In addition" becomes "rather"), but at other points makes the English flow better ("Khilafah soldiers" becomes "soldiers of the Khilafah")
2. "He will note that the translation of Bleeding Campaigns provided by the defendant would be exceptionally valuable in conveying the ISIS-propaganda message it contains, insofar as it skillfully employs a colloquial form of communication that is often used by jihadists who are non-native-Arabic-speakers. He will identify various examples of such colloquialization, including – but not limited to – using "Kenanah" in place of "Egypt" and "kufr" in place of "infidel." These syntactical, transliterative choices are based on esoteric and theological roots, and they convey a sense of authenticity and commitment to hardline jihadist principles espoused by ISIS and other jihadist groups."
- a. These changes reflect an observed ISIS strategy of transliterating (rather than translating) certain terms in order to redefine them for their own purposes, part of outreach strategy (Abdelzaher and Essam, 901-902).
  - b. Regarding the first example given, changing "Egypt" to "Kenanah":
    - i. Using the term Kenanah, which is used in the Arabic original and is an Islamic term for Egypt, could make the video less comprehensible to a general English-speaking audience, but might be understood by audience that is already immersed in ISIS propaganda.
    - ii. It is part of the nasheed (chant/anthem) that plays in the background. Small changes in the translation of these chants are not likely to make a substantive difference in the video's impact, given that these chants primarily seek to create an atmosphere and an effective response, such as a sense of power and awe, rather than convey literal meanings of words.
    - iii. The example given of "kufr" instead of "infidel": In section 1:10-2:05, the edited translation changes "kuffar" to "kufr", using a different form of the same Arabic root.

- c. 11:38-12:59-adds in Mujahideen, which is not in the Arabic transcript.
- d. 2:47-2:55- I agree with the annotation; the edited version fixes a mistranslation in the original.

### Comments on Expert Charlie Winter's description of the video compared to the translations

1. The video summary focuses heavily on the visual elements of the video.
2. The summary mentions some textual elements: (my commentary in color. Yellow- not substantive. Green- could have made more clear. Blue- could have made less clear.)
  - a. the nasheed (chant) at the beginning of the video. 00:19-00:29-minor stylistic changes only
  - b. The speech by al-Sisi where he "asserts that his regime will bring peace and security back to Sinai". 00:30-00:46-edited version may be slightly clearer than FBI version, but wording of both translations is awkward (incomplete sentences)
  - c. "The narrator repeatedly explains how the "mujahidin" of the Islamic State successfully hindered the Egyptian Army's attempts to advance."
    - i. 02:06-02:15-no change
    - ii. 02:33-02:46-"this battle followed the fate of the others" is changed to "this battle followed the fate of its sisters," an overly literal translation from Arabic that does not make sense in English.
    - iii. 2:56-3:10-"battle" is changed to the more accurate "campaign"
    - iv. 4:04-4:22-slight difference but not substantive
    - v. 4:54-5:14
      1. "the preservation of Allah for jihad" is changed to "the saving of Allah to Jihad" – neither are particularly good English.
      2. "repelled them caused great losses for the murtaddin" becomes "repelled their attacks against their honors and Deen, while inflicting great losses on the apostates". This is a fuller translation but some awkward English phrasing in both.
  - d. Followed by more of Al-Sisi, one of them he claims that there is a new phase in the conflict.
    - i. 2:16-2:32-"years ago we says that" is changed to "we have said two years ago that"-edited version more accurate and grammatically correct.
    - ii. "But again we says this event is still 100% possible" is changed to "But as a whole, to say that a 100% of that is possible – is – eh". The changed version is less clear overall, even though it does correct a grammatical error ("we says").
  - e. During footage of an ambush, section 5:23-5:40, quotations from a past ISIS spokesman are introduced, glorifies Jihad of snipers and sappers (unclear what the latter word refers to).
  - f. Narrator highlights setback the group has inflicted on its enemies.
    - i. 6:25-7:24:
      1. changed "assets" to "thrust," which may make more sense.

2. But English becomes more stilted- “and moved from defense to the attack” is changed to “and moving from defense to attack,” which is less grammatically correct for the sentence.
- ii. Millions “became wasted” is changed to “have become as dust dispersed,” which is more literal to the Arabic but awkward in English.
- g. Series of Egyptian public figures expressing support for the military’s operations. 7:25-8:04-quotes are revised a little bit for style, but the substantive meaning remains the same.
- h. Confessions-people admitting to spying for the military, followed by their executions. Executioners articulate threats to their enemies and express full support for the caliphate.
  - i. 8:30-9:07, 9:22-10:15-Edited version gets the age wrong, both versions make mistakes with the times. Edited versions fix some grammatical errors in English. A final sentence from the video is added where the speaker described informing to the Israeli officer. So, it would seem to make the man’s supposed offenses more explicit.
  - ii. 10:36-11:37-only minor stylistic changes
  - iii. 13:23-13:55-edited version fixes some minor grammar errors, is a bit clearer.
- i. Clip from field tutorial on how to utilize rocket propelled grenades. 15:48-16:10-no change
- j. The courage of the ISIS fighters is contrasted with the actions of the army, which focus on airstrikes and kill children. 16:58-17:16-edited version fixes some English errors, but is more literal to the Arabic and remains awkward in the English (“It release its anger with random strikes on the vulnerable peoples, and try displace those remaining” is changed to “to put its rage on weak people whom it wishes to migrate the remaining ones of them”). Fixes grammatical errors but adds more awkward phrasing.
- k. Narrator claims unholy alliance between Egypt and Israel, criticizes supposedly false Egyptian propaganda against the Islamic state. 21:48-23:11
  - i. introduces some awkward phrasing
    1. “the operations of the mujahideen” is changed to “stop the wheels of Jihad,”
    2. “Lying achievers and fake offerers” is changed to “fake achievements and pale shows.”
    3. “all the surrounding parties became involved in executing its chapters, and from that: the safe zone and the new dividing walls.” “Chapters” is an awkward translation of the Arabic fusul, which can mean chapters, divisions, or sections, but here should be “divisions”. “from that” is an overly literal translation of an Arabic grammatical structure and does not make sense in English.
    - ii. It adds a line that is not in the Arabic “Yet, how can they achieve that?!”
    - iii. It adds some parts of the Arabic text that were omitted from the FBI translation, possibly for brevity’s sake.
- l. Voiceover of another former spokesman proclaims the enduring nature of the Caliphate. 23:38-24:32

- i. Some edits make the English less clear. “Roll up your sleeves (misspelled)” becomes “be diligent to it”. “Spread eyes” is a literal translation of Arabic that does not have a clear meaning in English.
  - ii. Some parts of the Arabic that were omitted from the FBI version are added in the edited version. “As Allah has kept to it, by your unity and clinging to his Wide rope, that brings sadness to their lives, Doubles and doubles of they have seen and heard”. And “by the permission of Allah, an achieved promise”
  - iii. “They cannot kill our nation” is changed to “the war has not ended”, which is more accurate.
3. This analysis shows that the changes made to the textual elements mentioned in Expert Winter’s statement are a mixture of edits that can be seen as improving the translation, making the translation less clear, and having little or no effect. When viewed as a whole, it is hard to see how the edited translation has clearly modified or improved the message of the video as it is described by Expert Winter.

Disclosure Reviewed and Approved:



---

Drew Paul, Ph.D.

September 29, 2023

Respectfully submitted this 29<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2023.

/s/Wade V. Davies  
WADE V. DAVIES [BPR #016052]  
606 W. Main Street, Suite 300  
P. O. Box 1126  
Knoxville, TN 37901-1126  
(865) 637-0661  
[wdavies@rdjs.law](mailto:wdavies@rdjs.law)

# Drew Paul

Department of World Languages and Cultures  
University of Tennessee, Knoxville  
1115 Volunteer Blvd.  
701 McClung Tower  
Knoxville, TN 37996  
[wpaul2@utk.edu](mailto:wpaul2@utk.edu)

## ACADEMIC POSITIONS

2020-Present	Associate Professor of Arabic Department of World Languages and Cultures University of Tennessee, Knoxville
2014-2020	Assistant Professor of Arabic Department of World Languages and Cultures University of Tennessee, Knoxville

## EDUCATION

2013	Ph.D. Department of Middle Eastern Studies, The University of Texas at Austin
2009	M.A. Center for Middle Eastern Studies, The University of Texas at Austin
2006-2007	Academic Year Fellow. Center for Arabic Study Abroad, The American University in Cairo
2006	B.A. Middle Eastern Studies, Emory University

## PUBLICATIONS

### Monographs

2020	<i>Israel/Palestine: Representations of the Border in Literature and Film.</i> Published by Edinburgh University Press, 2020.
------	--

### Peer-Reviewed Articles

2022	"Transmission and Transit in Contemporary Arabic Literature: <i>Naql</i> and Its Limits." <i>Journal of Arabic Literature</i> 53(1-2): 100-131.
2021	"Impossible Figures: Re-Orienting Depictions of Gay Palestinians." <i>GLQ: A Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies</i> 27(4): 551-576.



- 2020 "‘The Arab Room:’ Detention, Disorientation, and Displacement in Palestinian Airport Narratives." *Journal of Postcolonial Writing* 56(6): 817-829.
- 2017 "The Grandchildren of Yūnis: Palestinian Protest Camps, Infiltration, and Ilyās Khūrī’s *Bāb al-shams*." *The Journal of Arabic Literature* 48(2): 177-198.
- 2017 "From Political Party Press to ‘Disruption’ in Palestine: The Journalistic and Literary Website *Qadita net*." *Alif: A Journal of Comparative Poetics* 37: 118-141.
- 2013 "One House, Two Shadows: The Rupture of Return in Contemporary Palestinian Literature." *Scritture Migranti/Migrant Writings* Vol. 6 (2012): 107-130.

#### **Peer-Reviewed Book Chapters**

- 2021 "Forced Migration and Fantasies of Return in Palestinian Cinema." In *Migrants in Perspective, Migrants’ Perspectives: Human Displacement in 21<sup>st</sup> Century Film*, eds. Nicole Wallenbrock and Frank Jacob.
- 2018 "A Palestinian Road(block) Movie: Interrupted Journeys in Elia Suleiman’s *Divine Intervention*." *The Global Road Movie*, eds. Timothy Corrigan and José Duarte.

#### **CONFERENCE PRESENTATIONS**

- July 2023 "Ruins of Mobility: Lost Transport Networks in Palestine," at the British Society for Middle Eastern Studies Conference, Exeter, UK.
- December 2022 "Tunnels and Resistance: Dystopia, Dissent, and the Underground in Contemporary Egypt," at the Middle East Studies Association Annual Meeting, Denver, CO.
- October 2020 "Palestinians without Palestine/Palestine without Palestinians: Time and the Nation-State," at the Middle East Studies Association Annual Meeting, conducted virtually.
- November 2019 "Arrested Movement: Palestinian Airport Detention Narratives," at the Middle East Studies Association Annual Meeting, New Orleans, LA.
- June 2019 "Transporting and Transmitting Dissent: Taxi Narratives in Cairo and Tehran," at the British Society for Middle Eastern Studies Conference, Leeds, UK.

- April 2019 "Transmission and Transit in Contemporary Arabic Literature: Naql and Its Limits," at the Journal of Arabic Literature Conference, the Cultural Turn in Arabic Literary Studies, in New York, NY.
- March 2019 "Impossible Figures: Re-Orienting Depictions of Gay Palestinians," at the Society for Cinema and Media Studies Annual Conference in Seattle, WA.
- March 2018 "Better to Laugh than Cry: Humor as an Act of Mourning a Lost Palestinian Modernity," at the American Comparative Literature Association Annual Meeting in Los Angeles, CA.
- March 2018 "Forced Migration and Fantasies of Return in Palestinian Cinema," at the Society for Cinema and Media Studies Annual Conference in Toronto, ON. Presenter and Panel Co-Organizer.
- July 2017 "Clothing as Ethnic Disguise in Israeli Film," at American Comparative Literature Association Annual Meeting in Utrecht, the Netherlands.
- November 2016 "Topographies of Literary Estrangement in Haifa," at the Middle East Studies Association Annual Meeting in Boston, MA.
- January 2016 "Rethinking the Political: Palestinian Protest Movements and the Circulation of Elias Khoury's *Gate of the Sun*," at the Modern Language Association Annual Convention in Austin, TX.

## AWARDS AND HONORS

- 2019 Departmental Nominee, College Convocation Research Award: Early Career, College of Arts and Sciences, University of Tennessee.
- 2015 Professional Development Award, to support faculty research, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, Graduate School.
- 2014 Fellowship, to support travel to the Oslo International Conference on Space and Place, awarded by The University of Oslo.
- 2012-2013 William Powers Graduate Fellowship, The University of Texas at Austin, Graduate School.
- 2012 Graduate Teaching Fellow, The University of Texas at Austin, Graduate School.
- 2011-2012 University Continuing Fellowship, The University of Texas at Austin, Graduate School.

2009-2010	FLAS Fellowship for Advanced Hebrew, The University of Texas at Austin, Center for Middle Eastern Studies.
2007-2008	Recruitment Fellowship, The University of Texas at Austin, Graduate School.
2006-2007	CASA Full-Year Fellowship, The Center for Arabic Study Abroad, American University in Cairo.

## TEACHING

### University of Tennessee, Knoxville, Department of Modern Languages and Literatures

ARAB 121, 122	Beginning Arabic I and II
ARAB 221, 222	Intermediate Arabic I and II
ARAB 251	Whole New Worlds: Fantasy, Sci-Fi, and Dystopia in Contemporary Arab Culture (in English)
ARAB/CNST 320	Middle Eastern Film (in English)
ARAB/MEST/HEBR 321	The Israeli-Palestinian Conflict in Literature, Film, and Popular Culture (in English)
ARAB 331, 332	Advanced Arabic I and II
ARAB 431	Media Arabic
ARAB 493	Independent Study in Arabic Language and Culture (in Arabic)

## SERVICE

### University of Tennessee, Knoxville

#### Administrative Positions

2022-present	Director of Undergraduate Studies, Department of World Languages and Cultures
2016-present 2014-2015	Chair, Arabic and Hebrew Programs, Department of World Languages and Cultures
2020-2021	Interim Co-Chair, Cinema Studies Program

#### Departmental, Program, and University Committees

2016-present, 2014-2015	Member, Executive Committee, Department of World Languages and Cultures
2021-present	Chair, Global Citizenship-International Subcommittee for VolCore (The University General Education curriculum)

2019-present	Member, Global Citizenship-International Subcommittee for VolCore (The University General Education curriculum)
2019-present	Member, Non-Tenure Track Faculty Evaluation Committee, Department of World Languages and Cultures..
2017-present	Core Faculty, Middle Eastern Studies Program
2014-present	Core Faculty, Cinema Studies Program
2017-2019	Contributor, Internal Fulbright Interview Panels, Office of National Scholarships and Fellowships
2018-2019	Member, Working Group for University General Education Revisions
2015-2018	Member, University Undergraduate Council
2015	Organizer, Global Awareness Lecture Series, Haslam Scholars Program

#### **Ph.D. Dissertation Committees**

2018	Jonathan Barsness, Department of Political Science (committee member)
2015	Ayşe İkizler, Department of Psychology (committee member)

#### **BA Thesis Committees**

2021	Katie Shannon, College Scholars, Arabic (committee member)
2019	Jonathan Thomas, College Scholars, Arabic and Public Health (committee member)
2016	Summer Awad, College Scholars, Arabic and Theater (committee member)
2014	Olivia H. Jones, College Scholars, Arabic and Public Policy (committee member)

#### **Lectures and Talks**

September 2019	"A Conversation with Etgar Keret." Served as Interviewer and Moderator for a public conversation with writer and filmmaker Etgar Keret at UT.
----------------	---

- November 2018 “Space, Culture, and Politics in the Middle East.” Roundtable discussion with Chancellor’s Honors Program students.
- October 2016 “Driving in Circles: Taxis and Political Dissent in Egypt and Iran.” Lecture for the Chancellor’s Honors Program.
- October 2015 “Fragile Walls: How Literature and Film Can Help Us Understand Borders.” Lecture for the Chancellor’s Honors Program.
- February 2015 “Why Borders Still Matter: The Middle East and Beyond.” Lecture at the Second Annual TEDxUTK Conference.
- January 2015 “The Modern Middle East: Where to Begin?” Lecture for the Haslam Scholars Program’s Global Awareness Series.

### **Service to the Profession**

- 2014, 2016, 2019, 2021 Outside Reviewer, *Journal of Arabic Literature* (4 times)
- 2021 Outside Manuscript Reviewer, Reichert Verlag Publishers.
- 2021 Outside Reviewer, *Studies in the Novel*
- 2020 Outside Reviewer, *MIFLC Review*
- 2018, 2020-2023 Member, Boren Scholarship Review Panel, Institutes for International Education

### **LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY**

English: Native  
 Arabic: Superior  
 Hebrew: Advanced  
 German: Intermediate  
 Persian: Intermediate  
 French: Reading knowledge

### **PROFESSIONAL AFFILIATIONS**

Middle East Studies Association  
 Society for Cinema and Media Studies  
 Modern Language Association